

INTRODUCTION

This section analyzes the impacts of the Whole Foods and the Park Shopping Center Project on park and recreation resources. The analysis in this section was based on the City of Malibu's General Plan EIR, prepared by Harland Bartholomew and Associates, the Malibu Creek State Park, General Plan and Final Environmental Impact Report, the California Department of Parks and Recreation, and the City of Malibu Department of Parks and Recreation. These sources are incorporated by reference.

ENVIRONMENTAL SETTING

Existing Conditions

The project site is currently vacant. Past uses on the site include a private skate park. The skate park was closed on October 31, 2011, several months before the proposed project's notice of preparation (NOP) was released on April 26, 2012.

City of Malibu

Recreational opportunities within the City of Malibu consist of parks, athletic fields, open space, trails, and coastal amenities, including coastal parks, beaches, campgrounds, volleyball courts and the Malibu Pier. The City of Malibu's park system is comprised of six parks including neighborhood, community, and wilderness parks.¹ The City of Malibu maintains and owns over 500 acres of parkland, including the Charmlee Wilderness Park (532 acres).² **Table 3.12-1, City of Malibu Parks**, list the parks which are owned and/or operated by the City, the acreage of each park, and the amenities which are offered at each site.

In addition, the Santa Monica/Malibu Unified School District operates several schools within the City. The facilities at each school site are available for use by local residents.

The City also maintains several recreation facilities including the civic theater, multi-purpose room, and Zuma room, all of which are located at City Hall. The Malibu Community Pool is located on the Malibu High School Campus and operated by the Parks and Recreation Department during non-school hours. The Michael Landon Community Center, located at the Malibu Bluffs Park is available to rent for private

¹ City of Malibu Parks and Recreation Department, Recreation Manager, Amy Crittenden, March 17, 2014 (written communication included in Appendix 3.12)

² Charmlee Wilderness Park is owned by the City, however the City has agreed to a land lease swap agreement with the Santa Monica Mountains Conservancy, who will be operating the park under a five year lease.

parties and company events, while the Malibu Senior Center offers monthly exercise and craft classes, luncheons, and social gatherings.³

**Table 3.12-1
City of Malibu Parks**

Park Facility	City Owned/Operated	Acreage	Amenities
Malibu Bluffs Park	City owned/operated	6	Baseball/softball fields, ADA accessible, parking, picnic tables and areas, restrooms, a playground, and a soccer field
Trancas Canyon Park	City owned/operated	13	Ball field, dog park, ADA accessible, and a playground
Las Flores Creek Park	City owned/operated	4	Walking paths, picnic tables, ADA accessible, a playground, and parking
Legacy Park	City owned/operated	23	Walking paths and an outdoor living learning center
Charmlee Wilderness Park	City owned/operated	532	Bike trail, nature center, parking, picnic areas and tables, restrooms, and walking trails
Equestrian Park	SMMUSD owned/City operated	22	Hiking trails, two riding areas, picnic areas, and restrooms

Source: City of Malibu Parks and Recreation Department, Recreation Manager, Amy Crittenden March 17, 2014.

Notes: SMMUSD=Santa Monica/Malibu Unified School District.

County of Los Angeles

Los Angeles County Department of Parks and Recreation (LACDPR) operates approximately 1,541 acres of parkland located within the City.⁴ Los Angeles County Beaches and Harbors, as well as the California Department of Highways operate the following facilities: Corral State Beach, Dan Blocker Memorial State Beach, Las Tunas State Beach, Malibu Lagoon State Beach (in conjunction with the California Department of Parks and Recreation [CDPR]), Nicholas Canyon Beach, Westward State Beach (also in conjunction with CDPR), and Zuma County Beach. A brief description of the facilities operated by the LACDPR is below.⁵

Coral State Beach: Corral State Beach is a narrow stretch of sandy and rocky beach located at the 26000 block of Pacific Coast Highway. The beach is used for sunbathing, swimming, and scuba diving classes.

³ City of Malibu, Department of Parks and Recreation

⁴ Malibu Middle and High School Campus Improvement Project EIR, 2011

⁵ City of Malibu General Plan EIR, 1995

Facilities on-site include a public bus stop, portable rest rooms, drinking water, one lifeguard tower, and street parking.

Dan Blocker Memorial State Beach: This beach also known as Corral Beach, is a long, sandy beach located at the mouth of Corral Canyon. It is operated by Los Angeles County for the state and has lifeguard towers.

Las Tunas State Beach: This state facility is operated by Los Angeles County. It is located at the mouth of Tuna Canyon, and has no developed facilities.

Malibu Lagoon State Beach: This 36.5 acre sandy beach includes the Adamson House Historical site and museum, Surfrider Beach, Malibu Lagoon Park, and a gift shop. The Malibu Lagoon Park sits on a 3.5-acre site. Facilities on the site include fee and street parking, rest rooms, drinking water, and disabled access. Surfrider Beach is a widely recognized surfing area.

Nicholas Canyon Beach: This beach has a rocky point break located just north of Decker Canyon Road with scenic bluffs planned for park development. Facilities on-site include fee and street parking, disabled access, rest rooms, showers, drinking water, and lifeguard stations. Point Zero located at this beach is also a favorite surfing location.

Westward Beach: Westward Beach is a part of Point Dume State Beach. On-site facilities include trailheads to bluffs above, fee parking, rest rooms, drinking water, lifeguard towers, and public bus stop.

Zuma County Beach: This beach is the County's largest sandy beach located just west of Point Dume, along Pacific Coast Highway. Facilities on-site include fee and street parking, showers and restrooms, disabled access, drinking water, lifeguard towers, playgrounds with volleyball courts, catamaran beach storage, a children's play area, and two food concessions (one at each end of beach). Zuma Beach is the headquarters for the Northern Section Department of Beaches and Harbors Lifeguards.

California Department of Parks and Recreation

The California Department of Parks and Recreation is responsible for the Malibu Pier (in conjunction with a private contract), Surfrider Beach (in conjunction with the L.A. County Department of Beaches and Harbors), Point Dume State Beach, Malibu Lagoon State Beach, Malibu Creek State Park, Leo Carrillo State Beach, El Pescador State Beach, La Piedra State Beach, El Matador State Beach, and Robert H. Meyer Memorial State Beach. Below is a brief description of each facility:⁶

⁶ City of Malibu General Plan EIR, 1995

Malibu Pier: This pier is a 720-foot-long Historical landmark with twin blue towers including restaurants, bait and tackle shops, a snack bar, rest rooms, fee and street parking, and public bus stop. The Malibu Pier is a portion of Malibu Lagoon State J Beach.

Point Dume State Beach: This 30-acre site includes the Point Dume Natural Preserve and is designated as an area of special biological significance. Sandy bluffs, various flora, tidepools, and offshore reefs and kelp beds which form habitats for seals and marine fowl can be found at this beach. Facilities on-site include stair access to the beach, fee parking from Westward Beach Road, and whale watching sites.

Robert H. Meyer Memorial State Beach: This state beach is comprised of the El Pescador, La Piedra, and El Matador beaches located along Pacific Coast Highway on the west end of the City. These beaches have stairway access, fee and street parking, portable rest rooms, drinking water and occasional lifeguard service. This site contains some tidepools, flora and fauna, scenic rock formations, and tall bluffs.

Malibu Creek State Park: The state park includes nature preserve areas, several creeks, Malibu Lake, a campground, and several trails. The 100-foot tall Rindge Dam, the Sepulveda Adobe built in 1863, and the Visitor Center which includes the colonial revival-style Hunt House, the popular Rock Pool and Century Lake.⁷

Malibu Lagoon State Beach: This state beach hosts a variety of waterfowl, both resident and migratory. The beach is located southeast of the Adamson House. The beach is rock cobble on the ocean side of the lagoon while the landward side is comprised of the alluvial fill flatland deposited by Malibu Creek.⁸

Leo Carrillo State Beach: This beach is located just north of the Mulholland Highway, 1 mile south of the Ventura County line. Tide pools, sea caves, and reefs are located along this 1.5-mile stretch of beach along with two campground sites with 127 spaces for tents and vehicles.

Santa Monica Mountains Conservancy

The Santa Monica Mountains Conservancy, a state agency, manages two parks in the City of Malibu, Corral Canyon Park and Solstice Canyon Park. Corral Canyon Park is approximately 16.1 acres and is located on the Pacific Coast Highway between Puerco Canyon and Corral Canyon. The park provides hiking, equestrian trails, and parking. Solstice Canyon Park is located at Pacific Coast Highway and Corral Canyon Road. The site is approximately 556 acres and provides hiking and equestrian trails,

⁷ Malibu Creek State Park, General Plan and Final Environmental Impact Report, Volume I

⁸ California Department of Parks and Recreation, Malibu Lagoon State Beach

mountain biking, picnicking, grills, camping, swimming, disabled access, parking, drinking water, rest rooms, and access to the Backbone Trail.⁹

National Park Service

The City of Malibu is located on the coastal edge of the Santa Monica Mountains, and is completely contained within the Santa Monica Mountains National Recreation Area (SMMNRA), which is administrated by the United States National Park Service (NPS). The NPS is responsible for the management, preservation, and enhancement of the scenic, natural, and cultural resources found in the SMMNRA.

The SMMNRA offers the City of Malibu numerous passive recreation opportunities, and an extensive system of trails. The largest contiguous land holding in the SMMNRA is the combined watersheds of Zuma and Trancas Canyons, with the lower canyons falling within the city limits of Malibu.¹⁰

Trails

The City of Malibu's Trails Master Plan, adopted by Malibu City Council in May of 2002 and revised in 2004, addresses the need for a Malibu trails system that would link the community through trails. A primary objective of the Malibu trails system would include an east-west trail spanning the entire length of the City of Malibu with north-south connectors to the main trail and connectors to trailheads and to the backbone trail segments in the Santa Monica Mountains. The Trails Master Plan identifies five distinct trail categories. These categories include the Malibu Pacific Trail (MPT), established connector trails, neighborhood trails, trails offered by property owners, and Safe Routes to Schools. The various types of trails in the City include hiking trails, pedestrian pathways, Safe Routes to School, equestrian, bike paths, and bike lanes on major streets. The NPS also maintains an inventory of trails in the City of Malibu.¹¹

The Malibu Creek Trail runs north and south and is located just east of the project site, as well as the Malibu Pacific Trail which runs east and west for the length of the City and is located just south of the project site.

⁹ City of Malibu General Plan EIR, 1995

¹⁰ Malibu Middle and High School Campus Improvement Project EIR, 2011

¹¹ Malibu Middle and High School Campus Improvement Project EIR, 2011

REGULATORY FRAMEWORK

Federal

National Recreation and Parks Association

The National Recreation and Parks Association (NRPA) is a non-profit organization dedicated to the advancement of public parks, recreation, and conservation. NRPA was formed on August 14, 1965, when five organizations, and in the National Recreation Association (NRA), American Institute of Park Executives (AIPE), American Recreation Society (ARS), the National Conference on State Parks (NCSP), and the American Association of Zoological Parks and Aquariums (an affiliate of AIPE) each involved in the support of park and recreation services in the public sector, merged to form a single entity. The organization has established parkland acreage requirements. For every 1,000 residents the NRPA recommends 1-2 acres of neighborhood parks and 5-8 acres of community parks. According to the Malibu's Parks and Recreation Department the City refers to the NRPA's parkland acreage standard and the Quimby Act standard (discussed below).¹²

State

Quimby Act

The Quimby Act of 1975 was enacted to help mitigate the impacts of development on the availability and quality of park facilities and open spaces. Under the Quimby Act, local governments are granted authority to reserve land for recreational uses. The Act also requires new developments to contribute in-lieu fees to local governments or devote land for recreational uses. Under the Quimby Act, requirements for parkland dedications are not to exceed 3 acres of parkland per 1,000 persons residing within a subdivision, and in-lieu fee payments shall not exceed the proportionate amount necessary to provide 3 acres of parkland, unless the amount of existing neighborhood and community parkland exceeds that limit. The City of Malibu adopted the requirements of the Quimby Act in Chapter 16.36 (Park and Recreational Dedication and Fees) of the Malibu Municipal Code.

California Coastal Act of 1976

The California Coastal Act of 1976 (CCA) is the permanent enacting law approved by the state legislature. The CCA established a set of policies, coastal boundary lines, and permitting procedures regulating coastal development. Further, it provides for the transfer of permitting authority, with certain limitations

¹² City of Malibu Parks and Recreation Department, Recreation Manager Amy Crittenden, March 17, 2014, written correspondence.

reserved for the state, to local governments through adoption and certification of Local Coastal Programs (LCP) by the Coastal Commission (CCC). Section 30211 of the CCA is intended to insure that new development does not interfere with the public's right of access to the sea where acquired through use or legislative authorization.

California Department of Parks and Recreation

The California Department of Parks and Recreation (CDPR) manages and provides sites for a variety of recreational and outdoor activities. The CDPR is a trustee agency that owns and operates all state parks and participates in land use planning that affects state parkland.

Local

Local Coastal Plan

Policies of the Local Coastal Plan (LCP) Land Use Plan (LUP) are designed to assure orderly, balanced utilization and conservation of coastal zone resources, taking into account the social and economic needs of the state's and City's residents. The Local Implementation Plan (LIP) was adopted to implement the policies outlined in the LUP of the LCP by providing detailed guidance regarding development in the Coastal Zone.

The following parks and recreation policy is included in the LCP:

LUP Policy 2.49: A trail offer of dedication shall be required in new development where the property contains a LCP mapped trail alignment or where there is substantial evidence that prescriptive rights exist. An existing trail, which has historically been used by the public, may be relocated as long as the new trail alignment offers equivalent public use. Both new development and the trail alignment shall be sited and designed to provide maximum privacy for residents and maximum safety for trail users.

The following park and recreation policies are included in the LCP and relevant to the proposed project:

LUP Policy 2.1: The shoreline, parklands, beaches, and trails located within the City provide a wide range of recreational opportunities in natural settings which include hiking, equestrian activities, bicycling, camping, educational study, picnicking, and coastal access. These recreational opportunities shall be protected, and where feasible, expanded or enhanced as a resource of regional, state, and national importance.

- LUP Policy 2.2:** New development shall minimize impacts to public access to and along the shoreline and inland trails. The City shall assure that the recreational needs resulting from proposed development will not overload nearby coastal recreation areas by correlating the amount of development with local park acquisition and/or development plans with the provision of on-site recreational facilities to serve new development.
- LUP Policy 2.8:** Public recreational facilities throughout the City, including parking areas or facilities, shall be distributed, as feasible, to prevent overcrowding and to protect environmentally sensitive habitat areas.
- LUP Policy 2.16:** Entrance roads, parking facilities, and other necessary support facilities for parks, beaches and other shoreline recreation areas shall be sited and designed to minimize adverse impacts to environmentally sensitive habitat areas and other sensitive environmental and visual resources.
- LUP Policy 2.26:** Adequate parking should be provided to serve coastal access and recreation uses to the extent feasible. Existing parking areas serving recreational uses shall not be displaced unless a comparable replacement area is provided.
- LUP Policy 2.37:** Priority shall be given to the development of visitor-serving commercial and/or recreational uses that complement public recreation areas or supply recreational opportunities not currently available in public parks or beaches. Visitor-serving commercial and/or recreational uses may be located near public park and recreation areas only if the scale and intensity of the visitor-serving commercial recreational uses is compatible with the character of the nearby parkland and all applicable provisions of the LCP.

City of Malibu General Plan

The General Plan Open Space and Recreation Element identifies goals, objectives, policies, and implementation measures that deal with open space and recreation issues including outdoor recreation facilities and trails. This Element is used as a guide for the maintenance of existing parkland and the acquisition and development of additional parks, recreational facilities, and vacant open land. The element includes goals, objectives and policies related to the City's Park and Recreation facilities including the creation of a safe, properly maintained trail system throughout Malibu's mountains and seashore that links recreation facilities and surrounding jurisdictions trail systems. The following park and recreation policies are relevant to the proposed project:

- OS Goal 1:** An abundance of open space contributing to a rural, natural environment consistent with this open space management plan.
- OS Objective 1:** Ample and diverse public parkland and open space, integrated by circulatory and visual links, to create a rural, open feeling.
- OS Policy 1.1.1:** The City shall encourage acquisition and dedication of appropriate land into parks.
- OS Policy 1.1.2** The City shall pursue all appropriate site acquisition, maintenance and program funding opportunities.
- OS Policy 1.1.3** The City shall preserve, protect, and enhance the character and visual quality of natural open space as a scenic resource of great value and importance to the quality of life of residents and to the enhancement of the scenic experience of visitors
- OS Policy 1.2.3** The City shall require development to link and integrate open space visually and link open space to activity centers, other open spaces, and scenic routes through a system of trails.

City of Malibu Parks and Recreation Master Plan

The City of Malibu's Parks and Recreation Master Plan was revised in 2012 and includes recommendations intended to serve as a framework for the acquisition of land and the development of recreation facilities for the City of Malibu. The goal of Parks and Recreation Master Plan is to balance open space resources with the need for active recreation.

City of Malibu Trails Master Plan

The City of Malibu's Trails Master Plan, adopted in May 2002 and revised in 2004, addresses the requirements and standards for trails and pathways throughout the City of Malibu as part of the City of Malibu's Parks and Recreation Master Plan, and addresses the need for a Malibu trails system that would link the community through trails. The Malibu Trails Master Plan Ad Hoc Committee oversees the implementation of the Trails Master Plan. The stated objective of the Trails Master Plan would be the development of a Malibu trails system that would include an east-west trail spanning the entire length of the City of Malibu with north/south connectors to the main trail and connectors to trailheads and to the backbone trail segments in the Santa Monica Mountains. The Committee meets on the third Wednesday

of each month, for the purpose of maintaining a trails inventory and implementing the Trails Master Plan.

The Malibu Trails System Maps were adopted by the Malibu City Council as part of the approval of the Trails Master Plan and used as a planning tool for development of the Malibu trails system. These maps do not identify any trails located on the Santa Monica/Malibu Unified School District (SMMUSD) property, but do identify nearby trails including the Morning View Pathway (Trail 7), Morning View Connector to Equestrian Center (Trail 8), and the Busch Pathway (Trail 9). Appendix A of the Trails Master Plan (Trails Ledger) identifies existing and proposed trails within the City of Malibu. The Malibu Equestrian Trail located on the Proposed Project site is included in this inventory.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS

Thresholds of Significance

The following thresholds for determining the significance of impacts related to recreation are contained in the environmental checklist form contained in Appendix G of the most recent update of the *California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Statutes and Guidelines*. Impacts related to recreation are considered significant if the proposed project would:

- increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated; or
- include recreational facilities or require the construction or expansion of recreational facilities, which might have an adverse physical effect on the environment.

Impact Analysis

Threshold 3.12-1 Increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated.

The proposed project includes a Whole Foods market and commercial retail spaces and would not result in direct population growth. The proposed project could generate some minimal population growth if employees of the Whole Foods or other uses were to move to Malibu from another area. However, employment associated with the project is not expected to result in a large increase in population (1) due to the limited availability of housing in the Malibu area and (2) due to the high cost of living within the City. For these reasons it is expected that employees would either be existing Malibu residents, or would live outside the City. Therefore the proposed project is not expected to substantially increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks. Further, the project proposes landscape features such as on-

grade landscaping, a tree canopy, green/living walls, and 4,500 square feet of landscape in the City's right of way contiguous to the property. Eighty replacement California Sycamores are proposed to be planted on the site to replace the 8 second growth Sycamores that are to be removed (i.e., a 10:1 replacement ratio) as well as 22, 000 square feet of green walls which are proposed on designated walls of the market and four smaller buildings.

The project also proposes two playgrounds for children (Shane's Inspiration Playground, and the Sensory Garden), a Kitchen Community Learning Garden, a gathering area for users, and several outdoor seating areas scattered throughout the project. The overall feel of the project, given the extensive tree canopy provided by large-scale Sycamore trees, the green walls, and the on-grade planting, will be that of a park-like setting. Patrons may decide to use nearby parks (such as Legacy Park) while visiting the project site, however, such usage would likely be minimal. Therefore, as uses associated with proposed project would not account for an increase in population and the proposed project includes recreation areas for patrons, project implementation would not result in the increased use or substantial physical deterioration of existing neighborhood and regional parks or recreational facilities. Impacts would be less than significant.

Mitigation Measures

No mitigation measures are required.

Residual Impacts

Impacts would be less than significant.

Threshold 3.12-2 Include recreational facilities or require the construction or expansion of recreational facilities, which might have an adverse physical effect on the environment?

The proposed project includes two playgrounds for children (Shane's Inspiration Playground, and the Sensory Garden), a Kitchen Community Learning Garden, a gathering area for patrons, and several seating areas, as well as several landscaping features. As discussed above, the proposed project would require the removal of eight second-growth Sycamore trees which would be replaced with California Sycamores at a 10:1 ratio. The construction effects of the play areas, community garden, and green amenities would not result in an adverse effect on the environment as the overall impact of these features (such as trip generation, water usage, etc.) would be minimal in comparison to the proposed project. Further, the addition of the play areas, community garden, and related landscaping features would provide a benefit to the community by providing additional recreational space. Impacts would be less than significant. No mitigation is required.

Mitigation Measures

No mitigation measures are required.

Residual Impacts

Impacts would be less than significant.

Cumulative Impacts

As discussed above, project implementation would not result in increased use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur. However, it is anticipated that demands on park and recreation resources in the project area would increase above current levels upon buildout of the proposed project and other related projects. This could lead to accelerated use of the City's recreation facilities and over time could cause these facilities to become rundown. With the construction of new residential developments, additional parkland would be needed to satisfy the Quimby Act requirements of 3 acres of parkland per 1,000 persons and/or the NRPA requirements of 1 to 2 acres of neighborhood parkland and 5-8 acres of community parkland for every 1,000 residents. Future development projects would be subject to the Quimby Act requirements, which would mitigate the demand associated with each future project through dedication of parkland or payment of fees. Therefore, the proposed project would not contribute to a cumulatively considerable increase in park usage and no cumulative impacts on City parks and recreation facilities would occur.

Mitigation Measures

No mitigation measures are required.

Residual Impacts

Impacts would be less than significant.